

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, February 16, 2016

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Ben Goodman (arrived 6:13 pm/agenda item #4), Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy (arrived 6:10 pm/agenda item #1), Charmaine Sutton (arrived 6:14 pm/agenda item #4)

Commissioners Absent:

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:07 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, March 8, 2016 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 15, 2016 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, January 19, 2015.
MOTION: Boyer/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record.
Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 16-2-4

159 Warren Street

Arthur James (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 16-2-4, 159 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, steel, half-light door, located in the center bay of the façade.
- Install a new, wood, half-light door, with single panel, to match the door that was removed, and the two, existing historic doors on the façade, as closely as possible.
- Cut sheet for new, wood door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED

2. 16-2-5

697 North Fourth Street

Crystal D. Park (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 16-2-5, 697 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Bar Rail

- Retain the existing bar rail on the previously approved fence, as installed.

Note: During the August 2015 review of the patio fence, the Commission had concerns that the submitted drawings did not accurately depict the slope of the sidewalk or how the bar rail would actually be installed, and therefore did not approve the bar rail at that time. Upon viewing photos of the bar rail, as installed prior to approval, the Commission found the installation to be appropriate.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

3. 16-2-6

942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Ben Ogg (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 16-2-6, 942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Window Opening

- Infill the existing small, fixed sash window opening on the rear of the existing one-story, rear, shed addition.
- New fiber cement siding to be toothed in over opening to match size, texture, and profile of existing siding, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Note: Removal of the window opening is being approved because an examination of the building indicates that the addition was originally an open porch that was later enclosed and sided.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED

HOLDOVERS

4. 15-11-24 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION)

200 (201) East Fourth Avenue

Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner & Andrew Losinski (Owners)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 15-11-24, 200 (201) East Fourth Avenue, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 15, 2016 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

Note: Based on the Italian Village Commission policy to remove an application from the agenda following three (3) consecutive absences by the Applicant, Application #15-11-24, 200 (201) East Fourth Avenue, will be removed from the agenda at the March 15, 2016 hearing, if the Applicant is not in attendance. Submittal of a new application will then be required to be placed on a future agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (7-0-0) CONTINUED

5. 15-12-7b

970 North High Street

Tim Lai/Tim Lai Architect (Applicant)

Investment One, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-12-7b, 970 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Projecting Sign

- Remove the existing projecting sign and conduit.
- Install a new projecting sign on the far left/north, wood, corner post of the storefront, per the submitted renderings.
- Round, aluminum cabinet, to have double-faced, opaque, aluminum faces.
- Wheat grain stalk and grains to be routed through and backed with 1/8" translucent acrylic.
- Letters to be 1/2" thick acrylic, push thru characters.
- LED illumination to show through graphics only, not entire faces.
- Cabinet faces to be SW6614 "Coral;" Cabinet returns to be SW7069 "Iron Ore;" Copy and graphics to be illuminated "White;" Posts and plates to be SW7069 "Iron Ore."

Install New Window and Door Signage

- Install new, translucent, vinyl window decals in the windows and doors, per the submitted rendering and drawing.

Transom Windows

- Remove the existing wood, infill panels in the storefront transoms, and install new glazing, per the submitted rendering.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (7-0-0) APPROVED

6. 15-12-12

53-57 Russell Street

Drew Sanderell/Northwood Rents (Applicant)

Northwood Properties, Inc. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-12-12, 53-57 Russell Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install Modified Window Openings

- Remove the existing brick infill.
- Install new stone sills and lintels to match size and material of the previously removed stone sills and lintels. Lintels to be solid, not split.
- Install new brick infill to match size of original window opening.
- New infill to be recessed 1 1/2" to 2", on an offset plane, to provide a shadow line.
- Size, color, and texture of sills, lintels, brick infill, and mortar to match original.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (7-0-0) APPROVED

7. 16-1-14b

790 North High Street

Alex Dever/Drawing Department Architecture (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 16-1-14b, 790 North High Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 15, 2016 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (7-0-0) CONTINUED

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

8. 16-2-7

180 Detroit Avenue

David Perry for Lykens Companies (Applicant)

LS Development174 Detroit, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #16-2-7, 180 Detroit Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

SITE A

The existing building closest to Hamlet Street (25') is a former manufacturing facility proposed to be converted to 20 apartments with surface parking spaces adjacent to the east side of the building. The following variances are requested:

- 1) 3333.18, Building Lines, to reduce the Detroit Avenue building setback line from ten (10) feet to two (2) feet.
- 2) 3333.22, Maximum Side Yard Required, to reduce total side yard from 16 feet to 3 feet at the narrowest point of the sum of the side yards.
- 3) 3333.23(b)(d), Minimum Side Yard Permitted, to reduce the 5' minimum side yard to permit the existing zero (0') foot side yard on the west wall of the existing building along Hamlet Street (25' ROW).
- 4) 3312.13(B), Driveway, to reduce the driveway entrance from the unnamed north alley from 20 feet wide to 17' – 4" wide, due to the location of City of Columbus light pole adjacent to the east side of the driveway entrance from the north alley to the parking lot. On-site aisle and maneuvering area is 20 feet.
- 5) 3333.25, Rear Yard, to reduce required rear yard from 25% of lot area to 7% of lot area.
- 6) 3312.49, Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required to reduce code required parking for 20 (previously 19) dwelling units from 30 (previously 29) spaces to 19 spaces.
- 7) 3321.05, Vision Clearance, to reduce the 10' vision clearance triangle for existing building to be located in the 10' clear vision triangle at the intersection of Detroit Avenue and Hamlet Street (25'), as depicted on the Site Plan.

SITE B

This site is a vacant lot and is directly across (south of) Detroit Avenue from Site A. The parcel is a corner lot and is 5,081 SF. Rezoning to the AR-1 District is pending to conform zoning for the construction of a four (4) dwelling unit building and detached four (4) car garage.

The following variances are requested:

- 1) 3332.18(D), Basis of Computing Area, to permit 90% lot coverage.
- 2) 3332.21, Building Lines, to reduce the Hamlet Street building setback line to 8' and the Detroit Avenue building setback line to zero (0) feet.
- 3) 3332.26(c)), Minimum Side Yard Permitted, to reduce the 5' minimum side yard on the east side of the proposed building to 3'.
- 4) 3332.27, Rear Yard, to reduce required rear yard from 25% of lot area to 3% of lot area.
- 5) 3312.27, Parking Setback Line, to reduce the Detroit Avenue parking setback from 10 feet to zero (0) feet for the detached garage.
- 6) 3312.49, Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required to reduce required parking from 6 spaces to 4 spaces for the 4 DU building.
- 7) 3321.05, Vision Clearance, to reduce the 30' vision clearance triangle for the intersection of Hamlet Street and Detroit Avenue to 14' and to reduce the vision clearance triangle at the intersection of Detroit Avenue and the alley east of the site to 5'.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (7-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

NEW APPLICATIONS

9. 16-2-8

936 North Fourth Street

Nicholas Gore/GoreMade Pizza (Applicant)

Kevin Noesner (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Based on additional information that was discovered by Historic Preservation Office staff following the February 9th business meeting, continue Application # 16-2-8, 936 North Fourth Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 15, 2016 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (7-0-0) CONTINUED

10. 16-2-9

638-642 North High Street

Keith Witt/Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)

Armbust Properties, Ltd. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-2-9, Commissioner Sutton noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #16-2-9 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

16-2-9a

Prism Glass Transom Repair

- Repair the existing, prism glass transom panels in the storefront along Russell Street in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards. (Please refer to, National Park Service Tech Note # 1, "Repair and Reproduction of Prismatic Glass Transoms." <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/tech-notes/Tech-Notes-Glass01.pdf>).

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-1[Sutton]) APPROVED

16-2-9b

Continue Application # 16-2-9b, 638-642 North High Street, to allow the Applicant time to further study the condition and potential repair of the prism glass transoms along High Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 15, 2016 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

The Commission requests that a site visit be arranged at which two Commissioners and HPO staff can observe the prism glass transoms on the High Street elevation with one or two of the existing plastic panels removed.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-1[Sutton]) CONTINUED

11. 16-2-10

844 North High Street

Tackma614, LLC (Applicant)

One Short North, LLC (Owner)

Install New Wall Sign

- Install one (1) new, non-illuminated wall sign, per the submitted, revised drawing.
- New sign to be individual, ½" thick, 16" high, acrylic letters "TACKMA," painted white, and stud mounted to existing, black cabinet.
- Existing backer panel to be removed and replaced with like material prior to installation of new acrylic letters.
- Text portion of the new wall sign to measure 1' 4" H x 7' 3-3/8" W (total 9.6 sq. ft.).

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (7-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12. 16-2-13

246 East Second Avenue

Matthew Hittle (Applicant/Owner)

Build New Garage

- Remove the existing shed building.
- Construct a new 20' x 20' garage on concrete slab, per the submitted site plan.
- Siding to be clapboard, to match existing siding on house.
- Roofing shingles to be from the approved list.
- One single, overhead door to be on the east, and one pedestrian door on the south.
- Access to garage from Second Avenue by easement, per the submitted survey.

Following the presentation of the staff report, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Would prefer not to have a curb cut on East Second Avenue, but, in this particular case, the property is land locked, and a curb cut already exists with a partial easement that was established long ago. Therefore, an extension of the easement to a garage seems appropriate.
- The Applicant should return with elevation drawings and materials at a future meeting.

NO ACTION TAKEN

13. 16-2-14

1069 Say Avenue

Jessica Moore & Timothy Foradis (Applicant/Owner)

Build New Addition

- Construct a new, two-story infill addition at the southwest corner of the existing house, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Construct a new, one-story connector between the existing house and the proposed new garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Siding to be 6" HardiePlank with HardieTrim.
- Windows to vinyl to match existing windows on house.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Has concerns about the overall size of the secondary structure. It is really big compared to the typical two-story carriage house, which is not to say that a two-story carriage house can't be done on this lot.
- Need more detail about the exterior stairway. If an exterior stairway is used, it should not have the look of a deck.
- Does not quite understand the connector piece. Need more details about the roofline and how it connects with the house and carriage house.
- The alley side of the carriage house should in some way appear to be the front of a house.
- The applicant can request a variance for parking. Consider the best that can be done for design first, then consider the need for parking. Parking on the pad could be an option, rather than all four cars in the garage.
- Dormers could increase the volume of space on the second floor.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks that a connector might be more appropriate for new construction, but not sure it is appropriate in association with a historic building.
- Agrees that an exterior stairway could look too deck-like.
- Is not too uncomfortable with the scale. More detailed drawings are needed to understand the scale completely.

David Cooke:

- In agreement with the comments of Commissioners Sudy and Lapp.

Rex Hagerling:

- Two-story carriage houses with second floor living space have been approved at other locations in Italian Village. However, the proposed carriage house is similar in scale to the existing house.
- Opposed to setting a precedent of encouraging an entire rear yard to be filled with a second house unless the lot is very big and/or there is historic precedent that two houses once existed on the lot.
- Will need more detailed drawings to comment on the architectural details.
- A two-story addition might work with a sloped roof, if done well.

Todd Boyer:

- A carriage house should pull characteristics from the existing house. Encourages the Applicant to look at the roof pitches, window types and rhythm, and other architectural elements of the existing house and bring them into the carriage house.

Ben Goodman:

- Thinks that some elements, even maybe the height, could be resolved when some other design elements are more well defined. For example, perhaps a gable roof could become a hipped roof to reduce the scale.
- An exposed foundation could help reduce the size of the side elevations.
- Encourages the Applicant to look at the proportions of the carriage house windows and how they relate to the existing house and other houses in the neighborhood.

Charmaine Sutton

- Has concerns about how the new roof of the two-story addition would meet the existing roof. Need more detail to understand it better.
- Would the Applicant consider a single-story addition?

NO ACTION TAKEN

14. 16-2-15

1069 Say Avenue

Jessica Moore & Timothy Foradis (Applicant/Owner)

Continue Application # 16-2-15, 1069 Say Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 15, 2016 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (7-0-0) CONTINUED

15. 16-2-16

186 East Second Avenue & 185 Punta Alley

Connie J. Klema, attny. (Applicant)

Kim & Michael J. Maurer (Owners)

New Construction

- Construct new, three story, single family dwelling on the vacant lot, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be stucco, brick and HardiePanel with vertical battens.
- Roofing to be rolled rubber and standing seam metal.
- Proposal includes a future lot split with one dwelling facing Punta Alley and one dwelling facing E. Second Ave.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- It's important to note the historical precedent of the development pattern in this immediate area, which included lots with two-story dwellings facing onto Second Avenue and onto Punta Alley, therefore, a lot split at this location would not create a new condition that would have a negative impact on the neighborhood.
- Punta Alley is more like a street than like an alley in this location. Would be fine with splitting the lot based on these two points.
- Would like to see the opportunity to continue a regular streetscape along Punta in this area. Would support variances to achieve that.
- Thinks vehicular access along Punta Alley, is appropriate in this particular area.

David Cooke:

- Thinks it's important to have a sidewalk along this side of Punta Alley.
- Because much of the frontage along Punta Alley will be driveway, it will need to be detailed so it is walkable and pedestrian friendly.
- Will need to see a site plan showing the grade and curb cut, sandstone curbs, and sidewalks in appropriate materials.
- Thinks more industrial materials and features could be appropriate.
- Lowering the roofline on one side or the other could help break up the massing of the façade.

Josh Lapp:

- Consider a driveway with concrete or pavers only as a tire path, rather than solid paving.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Referred to the new construction at 1111 Hamlet Street, which is modern but has a more industrial feel.

Ben Goodman:

- Will need to focus on details of the height, curb cut, and driveway as the project moves forward.

Rex Hagerling:

- Not totally sure about the height yet. Need to keep in mind that a similar building will be proposed facing onto East Second Avenue.
- Will need to pay attention to the adjacent dwelling rooflines.
- Is okay with a lot split in this specific location, based on historical precedence, the depth of the lot, and Punta Alley can support a streetscape of houses.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 16-2-17

192-194 East Second Avenue

Joseph Huber (Applicant)

Dianna Zweig (Owner)

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, brick, two-family dwelling.

New Construction

- Construct two new, single-family dwellings.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Steve Hurtt 157 East First Avenue Self	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Understands that the house needs major repairs, and has worked on other buildings in disrepair.• It is part of the charge of the Commission to maintain the historic fabric of the neighbor, and thinks this building should not be demolished.

Following the public speaker, and further presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- It would be very difficult to support demolition of a house that dates from 1899 or earlier, as is indicated by historic maps.
- Based on current and projected housing costs in Italian Village, restoration of houses is currently much more economically feasible than it once was.
- Could only support demolition if the house were in eminent danger of collapse.
- Would need to see a site plan before commenting on building a second house on the rear of the lot.

David Cooke:

- Is in agreement with the comments of Commissioner Sudy.
- Even in a case where demolition is approved, a building of similar style, scale and materials is likely what would need to replace it.

Rex Hagerling:

- Is in agreement with the comments of Commissioners Sudy and Cooke.
- There have been cases in Italian Village where entire brick walls have been taken down and rebuilt.
- There are lots of tools that can be used to repair and maintain brick houses.

Josh Lapp:

- Noted that there is historical precedent for two houses on the deep lots in this particular area.

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 16-2-18

Jeffrey Park/Parking Garage/Waldron Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 16-2-18, Jeffrey Park/Parking Garage/Waldron Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Construction/Parking Garage/Waldron Street

- Build a new, two-level parking garage, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior materials to be stained concrete, sandblasted concrete masonry units, and composite wood fencing, per the submitted rendering.
- Applicant is to work with Historic Preservation Office staff to provide a color study for darker exterior finish for the concrete sections of the parking structure.
- Rooftop light poles to measure 14' High at the perimeter and 18' High at the center, per the submitted drawing.
- Light fixture design to be per the submitted photo rendering.
- Landscape plan to be submitted for review by the Italian Village Commission at a future IVC hearing.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-1[Goodman]-0) APPROVED

17B. 16-2-22

Jeffrey Park Apartments/Phase IV/Building K/Waldron Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 16-2-22, Jeffrey Park Apartments/Phase IV/Building K/Waldron Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Main Entrance Area

- Option A - To replace a large part of the center EIFS with brick and lowering the parapet, per the submitted rendering dated February 01, 2016.

Note: COA # 16-2-22 modifies COA # 16-1-15, approved January 2, 2016.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (7-0-0) APPROVED

18. 16-2-19

Jeffrey Park/Phase II/Sixth Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Mulberry, LLC. (Owner)

New Construction/Phase II

- Construct six (6) new single-family homes, Phase II of a twenty-four unit development, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior siding to include a combination of vertical metal, horizontal fiber cement siding, and stucco.
- Main entrance doors to be full-light, metal doors.
- Windows to be clear, anodized aluminum.

Prior to review of Application #16-2-19, Commissioner Boyer noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Regarding the proposed cementitious siding, would find it difficult to support the specific proposed color. Would suggest going with a darker color.
- Would need to see a larger square of the material to understand the variety of the grain and color.

Josh Lapp:

- Even for new construction, exterior materials should not have a “false” appearance.
- The multi-color does not have the appearance of real wood.
- Asked about the use of concrete material with the form-work expressed in the concrete.

Jason Sudy:

- Does not think the faux grain of the proposed siding is appropriate.
- Referred to another material that has been used on some Market District buildings, which has a wood look, but is more grooved, not a faux grain and is in bigger panels. Does not have the appearance of replicating a faux wood siding.

Rex Hagerling:

- Would like to compare renderings of any new siding material with the originally approved renderings (with cedar). Would like to see it installed somewhere.
- Thinks the cedar would have a depth to it that the cementitious siding would not have.
- Understands that cedar may not hold up as well.
- There are other types of materials that could be considered. Maybe something that does not try to look like wood.

- Could the applicant put a section of the proposed material on a building and let the Commissioners take a look? It could be helpful to see it in the context of the building.
- Could not support HadieBoard for this project.

Ben Goodman:

- Agrees that a fake version of wood would not be appropriate.
- If in some way cleverly used in a different configuration than lap siding, it may be okay.

NO ACTION TAKEN

19. 16-2-20

847 Hamlet Street

Mulberry, LLC (Applicant)

4th Street Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-2-20, Commissioners Sutton and Boyer noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, one-story, single-family dwelling.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, single-family dwelling, per the submitted drawings.
- Construct a new, two-car garage with loft/office space, per the submitted drawings.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Steve Hurtt 157 East First Avenue Self	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Proposed demolition of any historic building must be taken very seriously.• Just about any building can be repaired, especially in the current atmosphere of the village.• Cottages of this scale are more rare and should not be lost.• Significant landscape features, such as large trees should also be preserved.

Following the public speaker, and further presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- The submitted engineer's report seems pretty favorable.
- Based on current property values in the area, just about any building can be feasible to someone to renovate. Not every person requires or wants everything in an old house to be new and fancy amenities.
- The house dates from 1891 or earlier. Even if there are better examples of a certain house type in the village, it does not mean that the few remaining examples should not be preserved.
- It would be a shame to lose the character and style of a house like this.
- Could not support demolition.

David Cooke:

- Agrees with the comments of Commissioner Sudy.
- While the preservation office staff did recommend demolition of the house on North Sixth Street, due to its condition, staff has not recommended demolition of this property.
- Referred to a similar cottage in the village that was preserved with a new addition, and still fits in with the scale of the area.
- Does not see the proposed new construction as a better solution to what is existing.

Josh Lapp:

- Could not initially see the character of the building, but understands that the character may be revealed when siding is removed.

Rex Hagerling:

- No additional comments.

Ben Goodman:

- Does not think the case for demolition is compelling enough.
- There are good options to rehabilitating this property.
- Thinks the existing house is a contributing property.

NO ACTION TAKEN

20. 16-2-21

901 North Fourth Street

Mulberry (Applicant)

4th Street Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-2-21, Commissioners Sutton, Boyer, and Cooke noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room.

Upon review of Application #16-2-21, 901 North Fourth Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3312.49 - Reduction of parking spaces from 46 to 27.
- 2) 3332.15 - Increase in lot coverage.
- 3) 3332.26 - Decrease in the side yard setback on the R-4 Parcel from 5 feet to 1 foot.
- 4) 3332.29 - Increase in height on the CPD Parcel to 53 feet.

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (3-1[Hagerling]-3 [Sutton-Cooke-Boyer]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **16-2-1**

920 North High Street

Mark Olson/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Emerald ECP Short North (Owner)

Approve Application 16-2-1, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Modify Previous Approval / West Elevation – South Entrance Door

- Install a new revolving door system at the south entrance, per the submitted rendering and floor plan, dated January 21, 2016.
- The revolving door will be located on the right, and the pedestrian door on the left.

Note: COA # 15-10-31b (November 17, 2015) approved the revolving door on the left, and the pedestrian door on the right. Reasons for approval: Installation of the revolving door on the right improves the pedestrian flow, and eliminates a pocket of space between the revolving door and curtain wall where leaves and debris would have collected.

• **16-2-2**

1120 North High Street

Kyle Katz (Applicant)

1120 N. High, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 16-2-2, 1120 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair Faux Stone Façade

- Remove any/all cracked and delaminated areas of the faux stone stucco system on the façade, per the submitted specifications.
- Reapply stucco to match the color, texture, and finish of the existing stucco system, as closely as possible.
- Carve stucco to match the coursing of the existing façade.

- **16-2-3**

32-36 E. First Avenue

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-2-3, 32-36 E. First Ave., for renewal of expired COA # 15-8-26 (Expired: September 15, 2015), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

New Construction

- Construct two (2) new, two-story, brick townhomes facing onto First Avenue, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings (Option A facade).
- Windows to be aluminum-clad, wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash.
- Doors to be two-panel, half-light.
- Foundation to be stone.
- Construct two (2) new, two-car garage with two (2) residential units above, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Revised drawings to be submitted for final review by the Italian Village Commission, including details of the water table, sills and lintels, stone base, windows, east elevation bay, porches, and carriage house string course.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all cladding materials, roofing materials, windows, dwelling and garage doors, porch railings, and light fixtures to be submitted to the Italian Village Commission for final review and approval.
- Landscape plan to be submitted to the Italian Village Commission for final review and approval.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

- **16-2-11**

829 Hamlet Street

Dwaine Young (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-2-11, 829 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Doors

- Remove the existing full-light storm door and the existing, non-original, six-panel, metal door at the front entrance/south elevation.
- Install a new, wood, three-quarter light door and a new, metal or fiberglass, full-light storm door within the existing door opening, per the submitted product cut sheets.

- **16-2-12**

30 Warren Street

Jason Rowland (Applicant)

Casa Di Citta, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 16-2-12, 30 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the roof of the commercial building, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Upon removal of the existing roofing that covers the inward facing surface and top of the parapet wall, Applicant is to submit photographs to Historic Preservation Office staff to determine whether any original coping remains, or to determine the appropriate material for new coping, if none remains.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.

X. OLD BUSINESS

• **15-11-34**

1126 North High Street

Greg Tishkoff (Applicant)

SG Real Estate Partners, LLC (Owner)

This application was reviewed at the November 17, 2015 IVC hearing. The accessible entrance piece was continued to allow time for HPO staff to meet with Building and Zoning staff to facilitate further discussion regarding ADA accessibility for historic buildings. HPO staff met on site January 7th with the Applicants, architect and Building & Zoning staff to discuss alternative solutions.

HPO staff will issue a staff approval for the following modified application.

Storefront Alterations

- Install a new, full light door, to match the existing.
- Install a doorbell at the entry for guests needing assistance with access.
- Replace the existing single pane, storefront glazing with new 1" insulated units to match existing (previously approved operable storefront system will not be installed).
- All existing wood storefront to remain as currently configured.
- Install new porcelain mosaic tile entry in exterior entry and the interior entry vestibule.

XI. NEW BUSINESS

• **ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION BY-LAWS, ARTICLE IV - Organization**

1. Officers shall be elected annually by majority vote of the Commission and should include but not limited to Chairman, Secretary and Recorder. Officers may be recalled for cause by a two-thirds vote of the Commission.

- Nominations for Chair
 - a. Rex Hagerling by Jason Sudy – Commissioner Hagerling declined the nomination.
 - b. Jason Sudy by Ben Goodman – Jason Sudy elected as Chair
- Nominations for Vice-Chair
 - 1) Jason Sudy by Josh Lapp
 - 2) Todd Boyer by Ben Goodman – Todd Boyer elected as Vice-Chair
- Nominations for Treasurer
 - 1) Josh Lapp by David Cooke – Josh Lapp elected as Treasurer

XII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:52 pm)